

802.1 Motions and supporting materials for EC - 07/2009

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to forward P802.1aj to Sponsor Ballot.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Messenger
- For: 36 Against: 0 Abstain: 6
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:
-

P802.1aj supporting information:

- Recirculation ballot closed 9th July 2009
- 91 Voters, of which 78 have responded (86%)
 - 35 Approve = 97%
 - 1 Disapprove = 3%
 - 42 Abstain = 54%
- A small number of editorials will be carried forward to Sponsor ballot
- The one outstanding Disapprove voter is David James (now deceased). His comments addressed (1) Editor's notes in the front matter that have since been removed, and (2) excessive capitalization:
 - *Comment Type* **ER**
 - Excessive capitalization, within subclause titles (such as Subtree), bad table formatting (without using the straddle capabilities to merge cells together), and single items described with two words (such as Root Port) make this hard to read.
 - *SuggestedRemedy*
 - Read the IEEE Style Manual and look at 802.17 as an example. After this comment is accepted, the first pass changes are made in good faith, and the leading prefix discussing the irrelevance of editorial comments is removed, I would be happy to review what editorial problems might have been missed. After the editorial problems have been fixed, allowing me to read the text easily, I would also become capable of providing technical comments.
 - *Committee Response*
 - ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The editor will review the text in the light of this comment and will make such changes as are consistent with both the style guide and the existing choices made in the base document (802.1Q).

MOTION

- 802.1 requests unconditional approval of the EC to forward P802.1Qav/D6.0 to Sponsor ballot.
- Proposed: Johas Teener Second: fuller
- For: 37 Against: 0 Abstain: 4
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

P802.1Qav supporting information:

- Recirculation ballot closed 9th July 2009
- 108 Voters, of which 72 have responded (67%)
 - 28 Approve = 100%
 - 0 Disapprove = 0%
 - 44 Abstain = 61%
- A small number of editorials will be carried forward to Sponsor ballot

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to forward P802.1AR to Sponsor ballot.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: wright
- For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 4
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

P802.1AR supporting information:

- Recirculation ballot closed 11th July 2009
- 106 Voters, of which 89 have responded (84%)
 - 17 Approve = 100%
 - 0 Disapprove = 0%
 - 72 Abstain = 80%

MOTION

- 802.1 requests approval of the EC to forward P802.1X-REV to Sponsor ballot.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: wright
- For: 35 Against: 0 Abstain: 2
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

P802.1X-REV supporting information:

- Recirculation ballot closed 12th July 2009
- 104 Voters, of which 69 have responded (66%)
 - 20 Approve = 95%
 - 1 Disapprove = 5%
 - 48 Abstain = 69%
- 1 outstanding “No” vote – details on next slide
- This “No” was ruled out of scope as it refers to unchanged/uncommented text from the previous draft; the MIB editor has proposed changes that will be documented in the Sponsor ballot cover letter, and which the commenter agrees will fix his problems with the document. However, the commenter declined to change his vote pending sight of the updated draft.

- **Comment:**

- smicng compilation errors: \bw\smicng\802.1pae-D4.0>smicng IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.inc
- E: f(IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.mi2), (2372,14) Size of default value for "ieee8021XKayMkaPartDistCKN" is outside allowed range
This is because the default is a null string while the TC Ieee8021XPaeCKN is SIZE (1..16)
MUST be fixed
- W: f(IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.mi2), (2501,1) Sequence "Ieee8021XNIDConfigEntry" and Row "Ieee8021XNIDConfigEntry" should have related names
MUST be fixed
- E: f(IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.mi2), (2512,31) IMPLIED is not compatible for index item "Ieee8021XNidNID", since it may have a size of zero
Having a table indexed by a string that may be zero length is not a good idea - MUST be fixed
- E: f(IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.mi2), (2683,31) IMPLIED is not compatible for index item "Ieee8021XAnnounceNID", since it may have a size of zero
Having a table indexed by a string that may be zero length is not a good idea - MUST be fixed
- E: f(IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.mi2), (2743,31) IMPLIED is not compatible for index item "Ieee8021XAnnouncementNID", since it may have a size of zero
Having a table indexed by a string that may be zero length is not a good idea - MUST be fixed
- W: f(IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.mi2), (889,23) Row "Ieee8021XPacPortEntry" does not have a consistent indexing scheme - index item Ieee8021XPaeControlledPortNumber from base row Ieee8021XPaePortEntry is not defined as an index item
Must be fixed - Ieee8021XPaeControlledPortNumber is defined as a column (not an index) in another table. It cannot be an index here.
- W: f(IEEE8021-PAE-REV-MIB-D4-0.mi2), (1050,23) Row "Ieee8021XPaePortSessionEntry" does not have a consistent indexing scheme - index item Ieee8021XPaeControlledPortNumber from base row Ieee8021XPaePortEntry is not defined as an index item
Must be fixed - Ieee8021XPaeControlledPortNumber is defined as a column (not an index) in another table. It cannot be an index here.
- *** 4 errors and 4 warnings in parsing

- **Proposed change:**

- fix the compilation problems as discussed in the mail exchange

- **Resolution/rebuttal:**

- The comment and proposed change identify text in the draft that was not changed from the previously (working group) balloted draft and was not the subject of any comment on that draft or any outstanding comment. The comment is therefore outside the scope of the working group recirculation ballot, and the document should be forwarded to the next stage (Sponsor ballot) since further modifying the draft as a result of completely new comments while in recirculation ballot processing is a potentially non-terminating process. The commenter has indicated that he could not have made the comment in the prior ballot because the MIB checking tool "smicng" was not available to him at that time due to license availability issues. Similarly the tool was not available to the draft editors, so the issues identified (which vary by checking tool) were not readily anticipated.
- The issues identified are confined to the MIB, and do not have technical repercussions through the rest of the document. A revised MIB has been generated by the MIB editor, and the commenter has indicate that when that MIB revision is included he would be able to change his ballot to Approve. The tentative revised MIB also addresses two other comments by the same commenter that relate to MIB DESCRIPTION clauses and to INDEXes. Clearly further MIB revision including refinements to the tentative revision could be expected as a result of sponsor ballot. The errors identified by this unresolved comment do not inhibit further comment and analysis of the proposed MIB.

MOTION

- 802.1 requests conditional approval of the EC, as per current P&P, to forward P802.1Qau to Sponsor ballot following completion of recirculation balloting.
- Proposed: Thaler Second: Finn
- For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 3

P802.1Qau supporting information:

- WG ballot closed 11th July 2009
- 101 Voters, of which 57 have responded (56%)
 - 13 Approve = 93%
 - 1 Disapprove = 7%
 - 43 Abstain = 75%
- 1 outstanding “No” vote from Mick Seaman. Comments and resolutions visible here:
- http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/Exec_files/802-1au-d2-1-seaman-comments.pdf

MOTION

- Forward draft PAR for 802.1Qbc Provider Bridging – Remote Customer Service Interface to the EC for approval to forward to NesCom.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Mack-Crane
- For: 35 Against: 0 Abstain: 2

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

- No comments received from WGs. PAR/5C text, unmodified from pre-circulation, is here:
- <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-qbc-jeffree-draft-par-0609-v01.pdf>
- <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-qbc-jeffree-draft-5c-0609-v01.pdf>

MOTION

- Forward draft PAR for 802.1Qbe Multiple Backbone Service Instance Identifier Registration Protocol (MIRP) to the EC for approval to forward to NesCom.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Finn
- For: 37 Against: 0 Abstain: 6

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

No comments received from WGs. PAR/5C text, unmodified from pre-circulation, is here:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-qbe-jeffree-draft-par-0609-v01.pdf>

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-qbe-jeffree-draft-5c-0609-v01.pdf>

MOTION

- Forward draft PAR for 802.1Qbf PBB-TE Infrastructure Segment Protection to the EC for approval to forward to NesCom.
- Proposed: Haddock Second: Sultan
- For: 37 Against: 0 Abstain: 5

- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

No comments received from WGs. PAR/5C text, unmodified from pre-circulation, is here:

- <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-qbf-jeffree-draft-par-0609-v01.pdf>
- <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/new-qbf-jeffree-draft-5c-0609-v01.pdf>

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward the PAR modification (updating of Purpose and extending the PAR dates) for P802.1AR to NesCom.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: wright
- For: 32 Against: 0 Abstain: 5
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

PAR text as circulated this week is here:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/ar-jeffree-par-modification-request-0709-v02.pdf>

MOTION

- 802.1 requests EC approval to forward the PAR extension for P802.1aq to NesCom.
- Proposed: Seaman Second: haddock
- For: 38 Against: 0 Abstain: 3
- EC proposed: Jeffree Second:

PAR text as circulated this week is here:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/aq-jeffree-par-extension-request-0709-v01.pdf>

802.1 Motion

- 802.1 authorizes the 802.1 Chair to take the necessary steps to initiate generation of an IEEE-SA press release announcing the transition of 802.1Qav to Sponsor ballot.
- Proposed: Johas Teener Second:Young
- For: 25 Against: 1 Abstain: 12

- Text of the draft press release is here:
- <http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/av-press-release-3-1-0709.pdf>

EC motion:

- The EC supports the release of the IEEE P802.1Qav Forwarding and Queuing for Time Sensitive Streams press release by the IEEE-SA, with editorial changes as deemed necessary.
- Proposed: Jeffree Second:

Motion

- 802.1 authorizes its Chair, Tony Jeffree, to forward the text of the liaison letter to SMPTE
- Proposed: Johas Teener Second: Garner
- For: 30 Against: 0 Abstain: 7

Text of the letter is here:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/liaison-as-garner-smpte-0709-v01.pdf>

MOTION

- 802.1 approves the liaison letter to the BBF regarding Duplicate MAC Addresses:
- Proposed: Haddock Second: messenger
- For: 33 Against: 0 Abstain: 3

Text of the letter is here:

<http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2009/liaison-response-to-BBF-re-duplicate-addresses-0709-v01.doc>